



Meeting Minutes

The 10th Steering Committee Meeting of the Hebron Courthouse Complex & Facility Management Assistance Projects

- **Date:** 5/11/2020
- **Venue:** High Judicial Council Headquarters, and other partners via Microsoft Teams.
- **Attendees:** :

Chief Justice Office: Chancellor Issa Abu Sharar (Chief Justice), Judge Asad Shunnar (Secretary-General), Mr. Shareef Qawasmi (Head of Facilities Management (FM) & Acting Head of Administrative & Financial Affairs), Mr. Nasser Alshiekh (Chief Justice Advisor), Eng. Kawther Kittaneh (tasked as Manager of Engineering Affairs Dep./FM), Mr. Mohammad Rjoub (Chief Justice Media Advisor), Mrs. Suhair Sharqawi (P.R.), Mr. Saleh Kaabneh (IT Dep.)

Members of Technical Committee of the project: Eng. Jamal Abu Eid, Eng. Nehad Rashed, Eng. Mohammad Abu Gharbia, via Microsoft Teams.

Canada: Mr. Jason Tulk, Head of Cooperation, Ms. Lydia Simpson (First Secretary-Justice Sector), via Microsoft Teams.

UNDP: Ms. Yvonne Helle, Special Representative of the Administrator, Eng. Jiries Awad, Hebron Courthouse Project Manager.

UNOPS: Mr. Tokumitsu Kobayashi (Director), Eng. Yazan Eideh (Program Specialist), via Microsoft Teams.

Hebron Municipality: Eng. Amjad Ebido, via Microsoft Teams.

Attorney General Office: Mr. Yaser Hamad, via Microsoft Teams.

Agenda:

Timing	Subject	Remarks/ comments
10:00-10:15	Welcoming notes & Introduction	Chief Justice/ Head of Cooperation
10:15 -10:30	Presentation of the Hebron courthouse by UNDP	Project Manager of the UNDP courthouse compound Project
10:30 – 11:00	Discussions on the Hebron Courthouse Project	
11:00 – 11:20	Decisions of the Project	HJC &GAC



	Steering Committee	
11:20-11:35	Presentation of Facility Management Assistance Project	UNOPS Project Manager
11:35 – 11:55	Discussions on the FMAP project	
11:55 – 12:10	Discussions of the Projects Steering Committee	HJC &GAC
12:10-12:20	Concluding remarks	HJC&GAC

- **Welcoming remarks:**

Chancellor Issa Abu Sharar: Chief Justice welcomed the attendees and thanked the Canadian Government and the implementing agencies of the two projects, and talked about the extremely complex conditions that the judiciary and Palestine faced in light of the health crisis and its economic and social impacts. H.E. pointed out that the judiciary had tried to keep the courts' doors open to a minimum, to ensure access to justice services to citizens. H.E. assured that the judiciary believes in the strategic importance of both projects, Hebron Courthouse Complex is a qualitative project that aims to provide justice services and comfortable and decent litigation buildings equipped with the latest technologies that help improve public satisfaction. As for the strategic value of the Facilities Management Project, it is represented in building the capabilities of workers in the various facilities of the judiciary, leading to the development of facilities and adequate provision of services to the Palestinian public. H.E. pointed out that there is a set of challenges and difficulties faced by both projects, either by the impact of the Corona pandemic or by challenges related to software-related factors or by the challenges related to the priorities that occurred to judiciary during this crisis and which was not fully able to harmonize between these requirements and needs or the programmatic framework on which the projects were originally designed. The steering committee meeting today, is an opportunity to get to know what has been accomplished in both projects, and what is being implemented now, and what will be implemented during the coming period.

Mr. Jason Tulk: Thanked meeting participants for their attendance and the efforts made to hold the meeting, especially under the circumstances of COVID-19. The Courthouses Construction project has been on-going for many years and is a flagship contribution from the Canadian Government towards strengthening the Palestinian justice sector, in support of a broader two-state solution. A lot of progress has been achieved in the Hebron Courthouse and Facilities Management projects over the past year and Canada is looking forward to the next phases of the projects

- **Presentations:**

Mr. Jiries Awad /UNDP: the progress in the building was achieved as follows:



- The building structure (the skeleton works) stone cladding works have been completed/ aluminum works are going on.
- Executing electricity works and implementing what is left of them inside the facility
- The UNDP will deliver all furniture packages documents to the council before the end of 2020, in order to launch bids for the furniture
- The solar panels tender documents are expected to be delivered next year

He added that they have achieved this despite the Corona pandemic and its impact on all life and work facilities at the site (showing pictures of the work that has been accomplished). He indicated the efforts made by the workers, whereby work at the site was permanently stopped during 4/2020, and they were able to bring 20-25 workers to the site during May 2020, in addition to restrictions on movement in the Hebron Governorate during 6/2020, and during 7/2020, there was no work due to the closure. He pointed out that all this affected the handover date of the project, as the handover should have taken place at the end of this year and early next year. It is expected that the handover will be at the end of 5/2021 and the handover and commissioning will be in 8/ 2021.

UNDP divided the furniture into 9 packages: (custom made wooden furniture) (metal furniture and accessories) (ready- made wooden furniture) (seating, benches and chairs) (IT, printers, monitors, video conference, and computers) (kitchen equipment furniture) (queuing system, security equipment and digital signage) (roof photovoltaic solar panels). Solar panels will be placed on the roof of the building to reduce electrical energy consumption.

In the stage of preparing of the building, Hebron Municipality must provide services related to water, sewage, communications, paving the street and paving sidewalks. He asked the following things:

- To contact the municipality and the telecommunications company to do the required (we hope that this meeting will help complete this procedure)
- High Judicial Council prepares the engineering staff required for the project (electronic and mechanical), (this crew was agreed upon during the previous steering committee meeting)
- High Judicial Council and Public Prosecution provide operational teams to start their work during this stage and in the next phase of the next year.
- The necessity of the presence of these teams in advance so that they are familiar with the work from the beginning.

He also indicated that 72% of the project has been completed. The Project Steering Committee was asked for the following endorsements:

1. Acknowledge the continuation of the current and future project stages.
2. Acknowledge new handover schedule for construction works.
3. High Judicial Council make sure that the Hebron Municipality will carry out all the required service works



4. High Judicial Council provides all experts, engineers and technicians, including Public Prosecution and police, in the operational and handover phase as early as 01 January 2021.

- **Discussion:**

Mr. Shareef Qawsmi: we ask the representative of Hebron Municipality, Eng. Amjad Ebido to talk about electricity, water and sewage.

(Answer) The representative of Hebron Municipality Eng. Amjad Ebido: the municipality informed that they are ready to provide the required services and the required cooperation in this regard, especially the paving of the street. And the municipality is fully prepared to solve all obstacles until the project is completed on schedule.

Mr. Jason Tulk: Thanked Mr. Jiries for his presentation and reiterated that safety and security remains the top priority for Canada. He implored stakeholders to continue to focus on this important issue, especially in light of additional safety challenges presented by COVID-19. In addition, Mr. Tulk indicated the following:

- Canada acknowledged the continuation of the current stage of the project.
- Canada acknowledged the new schedule proposed by UNDP.
- Canada also expressed concern regarding potential slippage of project timelines, especially in light of challenges posed by COVID-19. Stakeholders were encouraged to continue their close cooperation to ensure that everyone is aware of any future schedule impacts.
- Connecting the Hebron Courthouse to required municipal services and asphaltting the road are crucial in the next stage of project implementation. The HJC and the municipality were requested to ensure that all works are carried out as soon as possible to avoid construction delays.
- The commissioning phase of the project is extremely important to ensure the smooth handover of the Hebron courthouse and its long-term sustainability and functionality. The HJC was requested to ensure that the required experts are available no later 1 January 2021 to ensure this critical phase of the project can be initiated.

Chief justice/Chancellor Issa Abu Sharar:

- High Judicial Council is committed to providing the required engineering staff for the Hebron Courthouse Project (Mechanics and Electricity)
- Overcome all obstacles to adhering to the operating and maintenance schedule

- **Presentations:**

Mr. Yazan Eideh UNOPS: the goal is to build the council's sustainable capabilities for strategic planning and operational management, to assist in developing an organizational



structure, to raise the capacity to implement all plans, to define performance indicators, to train the administrative and technical staff in relation to facility management.

Project results: increase women and juvenile access to justice and different groups in a safe and effective manner, provide services to all litigators, and improve provision of gender-sensitive services by the Judicial Council.

Progress on outcomes, outputs and activities: increase capacity of HJC facility management personnel to develop gender-sensitive and environmentally responsible policies, all FM procedures (finance, planning, procurement, operations, maintenance and quality control), drafting policies and procedures and plans to be emergency responsive.

HJC is required to:

- Distributing and publishing procedures and managing facilities
- Implement and measure operational improvements

We work with HJC on:

- Plans of contribution statement
- Update HJC's project cards

Supplying a maintenance van used in the north centers, as well as maintenance tools and equipment for the three areas, north, south and center, which were distributed last week. We have started to supply equipment (spare parts) last week, measurement of operational improvements, strengthening of the council's governance that develop and maintain HJC facilities, participation in the preparation of the organizational structure for FM to be endorsed by General Personnel Council (other activities: appointing an operational staff in the courts, the council has to appoint a director to FM to lead the operational activities). Incorporate international FM standards and practices: organizing training courses for management and technical and operational levels, identifying the skills and competences that require organizing further training, training for technical staff training on operating and maintaining the electro-mechanical equipment that has been installed, training for all facilities management staff on health, safety, security and environment standards.

Completion work with HJC/ changes to risk and analysis: not installing CMMS (which is very important for the institution and the council requests to update its entire data center)/ The current offer for CMMS is until 30/11/2020; therefore, if the contract with the bidder is not signed before this date, UNOPS has to initiate a new procurement process for CMMS and this will incur more costs and cause more delays /Not implementing the new FM Processes and skills /Lockdown due to COVID-19 /Recruitment of the additional resources.

- **Discussion:**

Mr. Shareef Qawasm: please identify time plan, schedule, for the rest of activities.

(Answer) Mr. Yazan Eideh: 31/3/2012 is the original date to close the project, unless it is agreed to install the CMMS installation on the hardware for facilities management, in which case the project deadline will need be extended to 31/12/2021.



Judge Asad Shunnar (Secretary-General):

As for the outputs:

- We, as judges, are interested in access to justice for the various segments of society, which is the responsibility of the judiciary and FM project, especially in the reform period.
- We hope that the project will be a qualitative addition.
- There are other groups such as juveniles, people with disabilities and the elderly, were they taken into consideration by FM project?
- In Ramallah Court, the aforementioned groups struggle to access justice.
- Take into account the work privacy of the judges and their assistants in the court buildings.

(Answer) Mr. Yazan Eideh: when we talk about gender, we include juveniles and the elderly.

Mr. Nasser Alshiekh (on behalf of chief justice):

- HJC is still committed and interested in installing a FM program
- We have a technical problem and we ask UNOPS and partners a help to solve the problem because there is a risk of information leakage
- Project extension is related to solving this problem
- To extend or not the extension the project, it is depending on a clear vision for the problem

Mr. Tokumitsu Kobayashi UNOPS: we are happy with the HJC commitment, however:

- The message from the donor is very clear regarding the mentioned problem, and we must adhere to the plan and the scope of the project.
- UNOPS is accountable to the donor about the mechanism for using the funds.
- The donor has shown flexibility in supporting infrastructure to use and operate the software.
- It is recommended that the project be extended until 31 December 2021.

Mr. Nasser Alshiekh:

- HJC's message is also clear in this regard (the system's installation cannot be separated from the technical problem that the software will cause (the two issues are linked together).
- We do not want to solve a crisis and create another crisis elsewhere.
- We are interested in accepting and installing the software, but on technical bases and without side effect
- We cannot approve the extension without a satisfactory solution to the HJC, as the remaining activities may end in the near future, and there is no need for an extension, especially since other activities have been canceled such as trips and others due to the impact of COVID- 19.

**Mr. Jason Tulk:**

- The main goal of the project is to support the operation and sustainability of HJC's courthouse facilities
- The project is based on a long-term partnership with the HJC.
- The project's logic model, performance measurement framework and work plan were approved at the last PSC meeting in July 2019.
- Our internal accountabilities require the completion of the original plan.
- Additional requests may be considered at the end of the project if there are funds remaining.
- UNOPS has presented a solution whereby the FM software could be supplied with external hardware which would prevent any possible data loss elsewhere. This solution could also be compatible with future global database solution.
- It is understood that the HJC would like a new data center, but this request is outside the scope of the project.
- With regard to the extension of the project, given that COVID-19 has impacted the schedule for the Hebron courthouse project, it would be reasonable that COVID-19 has also impacted the schedule for the FM project.
- There are many remaining activities that can still be delivered under the circumstances that are necessary in order to meet expected project results.
- We encourage the HJC to accept the software solution presented by UNOPS, as well as the proposed timeline extension.

Mr. Nasser Alshiekh:

- We have conducted a technical study on the aforementioned topic, and Mr. Jason's solution solves part of the problem and contradicts the idea of a unified information center.
- We look at the whole program system, not one program.
- HJC will be held accountable about the Canadian funding and support for this project.
- We do not want half solution and we do not want to change the plan.
- HJC is open to any comprehensive solution to this problem.

Mr. Jason Tulk:

- There have been many years of collaboration with the HJC, including in-depth needs assessments and technical consultations regarding software requirements. This is the first time any concerns have been raised.
- We would like to put on the record that this issue has not been closed and requires further discussion.
- Canada is available and encourages that a meeting is held shortly to conclude this issue.

- Final Discussion:

- **The problem is not resolved with regard to FM software or the mechanism for extending the FM project until 12/31/2021.**
- **A meeting will be held next week for further discussion on the issue of the FM software and the FM project**



Miss Yvonne Helle UNDP:

- We are interested in the issue of the FM management program and hope to find a suitable solution; we do not want a conflict between the work of UNDP and UNOPS.
- We have worked hard to ensure health and safety measures in Hebron courthouse project, and we will complete our work in this regard.
- We reiterate our commitment to the scheduled and our dependence on our partnership with the HJC and the municipality to do what is required of all parties.
- We offer assistance and cooperation if required and where needed.

- **Concluding remarks:**

Chancellor Issa Abu Sharar:

- We confirm our commitment to overcome all obstacles.
- We confirm our commitment to the schedule for operation and maintenance.
- We have committed ourselves to providing the engineering staff required of special mechanical and electrical engineers for the project and for Hebron First Instance Court.
- We adapt the proposal to resume discussions and find a solution to the problem of the FM program.
- We are ready for any dialogue next week to find a solution that suits everyone.

Mr. Jason Tulk:

- We are committed to finding a solution to the FM issue.
- Terminating the project at an early stage would be a loss for all parties.
- The Government of Canada is working to build long-term investments through the Hebron Courthouse Project and Facilities Management Project.
- The capacity of the HJC plays an important role in supporting future projects from donors.

Prepared and translated by: Suhair Sharqawi/ Chief Justice Office

Edited by: Mr. Shareef Qawasmi (Head of FM & Acting Head of Administrative & Financial Affairs and Eng. Kawther Kittaneh (tasked as Manager of Engineering Affairs Dep. /FM),

Attachments:

- 1- Progress report of the Construction and Equipment of the Hebron Courthouse Facilities Project; a presentation submitted by UNDP
- 2- Progress report of Facilities Management Assistance Project; a presentation submitted by UNOPS